



**Midlands State University**

Established 2000

*Our Hands, Our Minds, Our Destiny*

FACULTY OF ARTS

DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH AND COMMUNICATION

STUDIES

DISSERTATION TOPIC

**Representation of the Community Share Ownership Trust programme in print media analysing power relations between public and private newspapers: A study of *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent*, from 23 January to 18 October 2014.**

By

**Zvakarongwa Mratu**

**Reg Number R115109X**

**A dissertation submitted to the Department of English and Communication, Midlands State University in partial fulfilment of the requirements for Bachelor of Arts English and Communication Honours Degree.**

**MAY 2015**

**Supervisor: Mr H. Mangeya**

## DECLARATION FORM

I Zvakarongwa Mratu (R115109X) declare that this dissertation is my original work and that proper citation and acknowledgement have been observed in compiling this document.

Student's signature.....

Date.....

Supervisor's signature.....

Date.....

## APPROVAL FORM

The undersigned certify that they have supervised, read and recommended for acceptance to the Midlands State University that the dissertation titled **Representation of the CSOT programme in print media analysing power relations between public and private newspapers: A study of the *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald* from 23 January to 18 October 2014**, submitted by student R115109X in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the BA Honours Degree in English and Communication

Supervisor

Signature.....

Date .....

Chairperson.....

Signature.....

Date.....

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

This dissertation has come to be not through my ideas alone but because of other people who gave of their time and ideas. My debt goes deep to Midlands State University academic staffs that have imparted their vast knowledge to me. It is through their invaluable assistance that I managed to come up with this research. Worth mentioning is the unwavering support and guidance that I constantly got throughout the course of writing this document from my supervisor Mr H. Mangeya.

And to God be the glory!

## **DEDICATION**

I dedicate this dissertation to my beloved son Nigel. Son, you have always been my source of inspiration consequently, I am principled to make you proud of me. May the Almighty God protect you against all evil and guide me throughout my studies. This is for you son.

## ABSTRACT

The study start out to determine the role of language in the strategic representation of the Community Share Ownership Trust programme particularly the case of the *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald* issues from 23 January to 18 October 2014. The research intended to analyse language used in the selected print media articles with specific focus on highlighting how it was manipulated by reporters of both newspapers to advance their ideological inclinations. The findings of the study reveal that the private and public newspapers contest for power through fundamentally divergent representation of the same programme. The *Zimbabwe Independent* affiliates with the opposition parties in a bid to advance their partisan interests. Therefore they expose a negative attitude towards the programme by representing it as impractical and irrational. On the contrary, *The Herald* positively represents the same programme as useful, legitimate and a vehicle for government empowerment.

## CONTENTS PAGE

DECLARATION FORM.....	ii
APPROVAL FORM .....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	iv
DEDICATION .....	v
ABSTRACT .....	vi
CHAPTER 1 .....	1
General Background and Introduction.....	1
1.0 Introduction.....	1
1.1 Brief background to study.....	4
1.2 Problem statement.....	6
1.3 Aims and objectives.....	7
1.4 Assumptions of study.....	7
1.5 Delimitations of study.....	7
1.6 Limitations of study .....	8
1.7 Significance of study.....	8
1.8 Definition of terms .....	9
CHAPTER 2 .....	10
Literature Review and Theoretical Framework .....	10
2.0 Introduction.....	10
Theoretical framework.....	16
2.4 Conclusion .....	19
CHAPTER 3 .....	20
Research methodology .....	20
3.0 Introduction.....	20
3.2 Sampling procedures for data collection.....	22
3.3 Limitations of methodology.....	25
CHAPTER 4 .....	26

Data presentation and interpretation .....	26
4.0 Introduction.....	26
4.1 Data presentation .....	27
4.1.1 A vehicle of Empowerment .....	27
4.1.2 Legitimacy of CSOT programme .....	28
4.1.3 Usefulness of the CSOT programme.....	30
4.1.4 Irrationality of the CSOT programme.....	29
4.1.5 Impracticality of the CSOT programme .....	30
4.2 Data Interpretation .....	30
4.2.1 A vehicle of Empowerment .....	31
4.2.2 Legitimacy of the CSOT programme.....	36
4.2.3 Usefulness of the Programme .....	38
4.2.4 Irrationality of the CSOT programme.....	39
4.2.5 Impracticality of the CSOT programme. ....	40
4.3 Conclusion .....	43
CHAPTER 5 .....	47
Conclusion .....	47
5.0 Introduction.....	47
5.2 Conclusions of the study .....	48
5.3 Recommendations of the study .....	49
REFERENCE LIST .....	51

# CHAPTER 1

## General Background and Introduction

### 1.0 Introduction

This study analyses the way the print media, specifically *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent*, represent the Community Share Ownership Trust (CSOT) programme. Lack of clarity and updates concerning empowerment of the marginalized communities in resource rich areas will be focused on. President Mugabe launched several CSOTs across the country prior to 2013 harmonised elections. The trusts were launched in 2012 so that the communities would get empowered by directly benefiting from their natural resources. According to *the Zimbabwe Independent* (2014), the amount of money availed towards the CSOT programme in Marange-Zimunya is not known to the public. The matter of unclarified issues concerning people's empowerment in Marange Zimunya communities is due to the government's silence over the progress of the programme. This implies that the involved participants and the government at large lack transparency concerning this empowerment programme. It seems they are silent about operational system of the CSOTs. Noelle-Neumann (1972) propounds that mass media are a part of the system which people use to gain information about the natural world. The government's lack of clarity and updates on the CSOTs in the newspapers was detrimental to the beneficiaries since they could not map out the future in terms of sustainability of this empowerment programme. Empowerment of indigenous Zimbabweans is done through representation.

Hall (1997) defines representation as an essential part of the process by which meaning is produced and exchanged between members of a culture. It involves the use of language, signs and images which stand for things. This implies that entities (people, objects and events) in the world do not have in themselves any fixed or true meaning. Consequently, the print media produces news stories mostly to sustain the interests of the powerful social elites. Gramsci (1971) in his concept of hegemony asserts that “class is dominant in two ways- leading and dominating. The ruling class leads the classes which are its allies, and dominates those which are its enemies”. In line with Gramsci’s notion, Director of Research and Advocacy in the Solidarity Peace Trust, Brian Raftopoulos argues that although the indigenization initiative remains noble, ZANU PF has used the controversial programme as a gimmick to gain popularity. He also asserts that by implementing this controversial programme, ZANU PF managed to regain supporters whom it lost to the MDCs in the 2008 disputed elections and increase its support base *Zimbabwe Independent* (2014).

The researcher focuses on *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* since the former is state owned while the latter is privately owned. The selection was done to create a platform where different perspectives would be exposed by the two media houses for better understanding of representation. The selection of these newspapers facilitates the understanding of power relations between them since they are competing in the same environment. There is nothing innocent about representation, every representation is associated with politics despite what actually transpires on the ground. Therefore the ruling class leads its supporters and dominates opposition parties.

Mawowa (2013) observes that the CSOTs are likely to be affected by elite manipulation since they are controlled and chaired by chiefs. The chiefs’ actions are hardly monitored or

questioned due to their links with ZANU PF. To make matters worse, ZANU PF is the designer of the Indigenisation Policy. Consequently, it is Negi's (2000) lamentation that the appointment of chiefs at times makes them benefit at the expense of the whole community. The discourse of empowering the indigenous Zimbabweans has for long been represented by the government through media as something noble and significant hence it became so dominant that the audiences view it as something that cannot be alternated despite its weaknesses. It is something undeniable that most inhabitants in Zimbabwean communities are marginalized economically due to historical colonialism. The fact that most people encounter undescriptive suffering due to insufficient basic needs which encompass food, medical care, sources of clean water and shelter is not an assumption in developing countries. According to the *Zimbabwe Independent* (2014), supporters of opposition parties regard the establishment of CSOT as a strategic campaign by the ruling party considering the fact that the programme was initiated towards 2013 presidential elections which were held on 31 July. This idea is in agreement with Chakaodza (2003) who postulates that the privately owned media is there to watch the ills of the government such as corruption and human rights violation. The CSOT programme was portrayed as a significant mechanism for ensuring broad based empowerment in Zimbabwe by *The Herald* (2014). As part of the indigenization and empowerment programme, CSOT is funded by foreign based companies involved in the exploitation of natural resources.

The motive behind initiation of CSOT was to ensure a broad based socio-economic empowerment in that local people within areas where foreign companies are established benefit from the exploitation of their natural resources. Therefore local communities were allocated 10% share stake as stipulated by the amended Statutory Instrument 21. The study as

well unfolds the strength endorsed in language to construct events through reported stories. Newspaper stories discursively construct the elevation of communities through CSOT in ways that reinforce the interests of the ruling class at the expense of the marginalized social groups. Their suffering is being represented by media, they are not active participants. However Hall (1982) argues that audiences have some freedom to misinterpret implying that the audience is left with some space to make personal evaluation depending on what they already know concerning the given issue. Representation can be analysed because it is something constructed and does not therefore reflect absolute truth. Gramsci (1971) argues that there is never objective truth. Every issue is represented according to discourses swirling around them.

## **1.1 Brief background to study**

The need to empower the majority indigenous Zimbabweans influenced the crafting of the Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment Act (Chapter 14:33) of 2007 which stipulates 51% of business in Zimbabwe be controlled by indigenous Zimbabweans. In 2011 the government of Zimbabwe embarked on empowerment of indigenous citizens through CSOT programme of which is a product of the Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment Act (NIEEB 2013). The first CSOT to be launched by President Mugabe was Mhondoro Ngezi CSOT programme funded by Zimplats on 13 October 2011 followed by Tongogara CSOT on the 24<sup>th</sup> of November 2011 which is funded by Unki Mine. In partnership with Mimosa Mining Company His Excellency President Robert Gabriel Mugabe launched Zvishavane CSOT on the 16<sup>th</sup> of February 2012 at Mimosa Mining Company (ZCSOT Deed 2012). According to the Herald (2014), many others were established countrywide up to a total number of 59 CSOTs. According to the

Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment Act, qualifying businesses particularly in the mining sector were to cede 10% indigenization portion to the local communities considering that they have been exploiting natural resources from their respective areas. Thus embodied organization of CSOT in every part of marginalized rural areas where the soil is poor and exhausted to ensure Socio-economic development.

The colonial regime which existed in Zimbabwe prior to attainment of independence was characterized by dispossession and marginalization as well as exclusion of indigenous Zimbabweans from participation in the mainstream economy *Zimpapers* (2010). The privately owned newspaper mostly portrays CSOT programme negatively whilst the state owned portrays the programme positively. The use of language by the state owned newspaper is centered on protecting the image of the government yet the privately owned does not hesitate to picture the government negatively. Therefore the researcher is determined to unravel how media operate particularly in connection to cotemporary political categories.

Text in media discourse carries a lot of weight and the audience is made to believe that what is prescribed in a particular newspaper article is real and effective. However if the media keep muted concerning certain issues the situation of the waiting audiences becomes controversial. Price's (2000) idea is considered as motivation towards this research when he says "the media has a role to play in providing a truthful, comprehensive, and intelligent account of events in society in a context which gives them meaning and relevance." However the idea is prone to challenge due to the existence of different views by other scholars for instance, Wodak (1997) argues that the use of words is not an innocent process implying that representation is done to support a particular

ideology. It is relevant to exhibit that power is something discursive therefore it can be moved from one group to another.

The study also is determined to address to social problems. Participants involved are variable. They include political officials, foreign investors, journalists and the marginalized indigenous Zimbabweans. The audience is normally characterised by passivity yet the owners of the media house are active and more powerful than the former. Media ownership determines what would be conveyed to the audience and should be omitted for obviously reasons to serve their interests. The ruling class uses words like “empowerment” to attract the powerless majority who are jobless and poverty-stricken. The fact that the underprivileged section of the society is vulnerable influences them to embrace innovations by the powerful ruling elites. It is only later that the target audience could realise that the government actually has nothing much to show in as far as the empowerment programme is concerned.

## **1.2 Problem statement**

The CSOT programme was initiated for the betterment of resource rich community people’s livelihood. In regard to this, the research intends to account for the differences occurring in the representation of the same programme by *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent*. It also seeks to expose how power is exercised through media be it economic, social or political. The study seeks to reveal how representation in print media entails power struggles between the selected media houses whereby powerful participants advance their partisan interests through manipulation of language.

### **1.3 Aims and objectives**

The research focuses on ways in which the issue of CSOT linked to power relations. Objectives emanating from this aim are:

- To examine power relations between the two media houses representing the CSOT programme.
- To learn and understand how language is used by powerful social groups to shape reality.
- To analyse possible reasons behind the government's silence pertaining the empowerment programme which was much talked about before the 2013 presidential elections.
- To examine the lexico-grammatical choices on the coverage of CSOT programme.

### **1.4 Assumptions of study**

- The two newspapers represent the CSOT programme in different perspectives
- *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* align themselves to different ideological positions.
- The representation of the CSOT programme is closely linked to power struggle
- The issue of CSOT programme is associated with political motives

### **1.5 Delimitations of study**

The study focuses on textual analysis of the two newspapers, *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* on the representation of Community Share Ownership Trust programme. The news

reports of 13 March to 18 October 2014 about the issue of CSOT are concentrated on. The researcher selected eight newspaper stories, four from *The Herald* and the other four the *Zimbabwe Independent*.

## **1.6 Limitations of study**

It was not smooth during selection of relevant information since the programme is no longer frequently talked about. This led the researcher to use articles from a weekly newspaper and a daily newspaper. It was not possible to find articles on the representation of the CSOT programme at the same period by both papers. Additionally, the nature of the study does not accommodate other people's ideas.

## **1.7 Significance of study**

According to Hall (1982) the media has the power to select what to represent as reality and what to exclude. This perspective helps researchers to comprehend that representation is attached to sustaining the interests of powerful social groups because they are able to cover up their ills through texts. It is the role of this study to enlighten the underprivileged groups to fight for their rights whenever they are violated. The research would as well expose to relevant audiences that silence emanates from several vexing issues one of them being the problem of social inequality. Lack of transparency especially in distribution of public funds causes the respective figures to be quiet when they are expected to speak out. The coverage of CSOT needs to be analysed so as to find out what actually inspires the media to represent the same programme in different if not contradicting ways. This study is significant to the ministry because they will recognize the need for transparent strategies to revive the day to day running of the programme as a

mechanism of socio- economic empowerment. It will also dawn to the ministry that the programme is a noble idea if only transparently and properly handled. Appropriate management of the programme would result in benefits flowing to communities affected by mining operations and related extracting industries. The chronicled criticism from the privately owned newspaper would make the ministry realize that power is something contestable consequently they should fulfil the stipulations of the empowerment plan in order to secure support from the beneficiaries.

## **1.8 Definition of terms**

**Critical Discourse Analysis** is a type of discourse analytical research that studies the way social power abuse, dominance and inequality are enacted, reproduced and resisted by text and talk in the social and political context.

**Hegemony** means political leadership based on the consent of the ruled

**Ministry** means the ministry of Youth Development and Empowerment or its successor ministry responsible for indigenization and empowerment.

**Naturalization** is a representational strategy designed to fix difference and thus secure it forever. It is an attempt to halt the inevitable slide of meaning to secure discursive or ideological closure.

**Qualifying business** means any business involved in exploiting the natural resources of the community.

**Representation** is the production of meaning through language

## CHAPTER 2

### Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

#### 2.0 Introduction

This chapter allows for discussions of relevant literature to the study. It is also in this chapter where definitions and illustrations of components essential to the study are provided in a bid to locate the relation and deviation of the research from already established similar studies on the same field. CDA is also explored in this chapter as it is the selected theoretical framework of the study.

#### 2.1 Literature review

Literature review, according to Cooper (1998), uses as its database reports of primary or original scholarship, and does not report new primary scholarship itself. Bruce (1994) postulates that the purpose of a literature review is to provide the background and justification for the research undertaken. This communication research pays much attention to the representation of the CSOT programme by *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent*. Representation is an essential process through which information is conveyed to the audiences.

Hall (1997) suggests that the notion of representation is surrounded by three approaches of how language is used to represent the world. These allow for the reflective, intentional and constructionist approaches. In as far as the reflective approach is concerned, meaning is believed to be situated within the objects, people or events in the world and language serves like a mirror to reflect true meaning as it already exist in the real world. In the second approach, meaning in representation entails that it is the speaker who imposes their unique meaning on the world

through language. This is called the intentional approach where words mean what the author intends they should mean. Therefore it is appropriate to argue that in the immediate research *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* employ the intentional approach every time that they manage to make people believe their representations.

The third approach is the most applicable to the current study. It is called the constructionist approach, it acknowledges that neither things in themselves nor the individual uses of language can fix meaning in language. Things do not mean people construct meaning, using representational systems-concepts and signs. This approach views representation as a process where meaning is socially constructed. In this sense representation does not imitate reality but instead produces it. This means that reality is fluid as it depends on who constructs it therefore it can be deconstructed. The third approach to meaning in language is in agreement with Hall's (1997) conception that representations are political since they are a construction of reality. In the case of *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent*, it is vital to note that reality concerning the CSOT programme is produced by representation. The ongoing programme is characterized by different images depending on who is actually conveying the development discourse through CSOT. Representation as it is political facilitates the public media to establish or advance their political position. The same applies to the private media.

Moreover, Hall (1982) argues that the media is involved in the selection, filtering, structuring and shaping of social reality. Consequently, Hall's study is the most appropriate window opening to the researcher on how the work of representation following that most audiences construct meaning basing on the representational systems employed by the newspapers. Hall's depiction of representation points at the centrality of language. According to Hall (2008) representation is the way in which meaning is given to depict images and words which stand for something else.

Media therefore represent the actual events but they become biased and distorted since Hall (2008) postulates that ideology and power fixes the meaning. The media convey reports to the society basing on a certain set of ideologies. It is the quest of the present study to reveal how the public and the private media, *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* respectively, align themselves to different ideological standing points. This as well drives home the idea that the two newspapers are active political actors who struggle for power.

Hall (2008) argues that communication of these ideologies is linked with power and those groups that build power have control over what gets represented in the media. Here the issue of media ownership takes a full swing; journalists working for pro government media houses like *The Herald* do not have freedom to expose the negative image of the government. They would try by all means possible to reclaim the government's reputation if the need arises. Media ownership also determines the content that the audiences acquire from media. The immediate study recognizes that the media are affiliated with different political parties hence this actually has an impact on the way they construct reality. *The Herald* is associated to ZANU PF while the *Zimbabwe Independent* is associated to the opposition parties.

Foucault (1976/1994) refers to power as something that produces knowledge as it is conveyed and contested through discourse. This implies that powerful groups are privileged to produce knowledge of which would be regarded as reality. Talbot (2007) argues that discourses are bodies of knowledge that shape people. They delineate positions of power to social actors. They as well take place in social interaction in specific situations and therefore, discourse is a discursive and a social practice. The texts produced by *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* shape the audiences' perspectives. Their attitudes towards the government become divided depending on what they choose to believe in. Obviously supporters of the ruling party

are likely to believe the content of *The Herald* and ignore the negativity portrayed against ZANU PF by the *Zimbabwe Independent*. Media discourse therefore strongly affects the way people view the world and the way they define communicative events. For instance, the initiation of the CSOT programme was embraced by ZANU PF supporters as a noble developmental strategy because media discourse has the power to make people believe its content. Foucault (1976/1994) concedes that truth is socially determined. It is something that is socially constructed and subject to change. The state owned and the privately owned newspapers exhibit power struggle for they are competing in the same environment targeting the same audiences whilst their representations differ but they both claim to be conveying reality. The powerful social actors decide on what to convey as truth to the audiences and what to exclude from their representations. However it is all up to the audiences to select what they can regard as truth. The process involves application of what they already know about the subject being represented. They may choose to believe in the colonial historical justification of the establishment of the programme or regard it in relation to the contemporary political situation. Tuchman (1976: 97) argues that,

To say that a news report is a story, no more but no less is not to demean news nor accuse it of being fictitious. Rather it alerts us that news like all other public documents, is a constructed reality possessing its own internal validity.

This gives the implication that though news is based on facts but it is inflected by certain ideologies associated with media ownership resultantly, news becomes a socially constructed reality. The media are seen as political actors for they are associated to different political parties in the country. *The Herald* is basically perpetuating the interests of the ruling party to safeguard its reputation and popularity. It does not necessarily consider what actually transpires on the

ground in as far as elevation of indigenous Zimbabweans is concerned. *The Herald* is a powerful political actor which produces texts that positively depict the CSOT programme. *The Zimbabwe Independent* on the other hand represents the programme negatively to expose its shortcomings in the course of elevating the deserving beneficiaries. According to MacDonald (2003), helping to construct specific versions of reality is the unique role of the media. This perception connotes that what is being produced by the Herald and the Zimbabwe Independent is not the objective truth but they shape the audiences' perceptions and understandings.

Several researchers represented assessment of the effectiveness of the programme from a development perspective. Machinya (2014) investigated the contribution of community ownership of mineral wealth through Community Share Ownership Trusts to community development. Additionally, Masimbiti's (2013) thesis focused on the assessment of the socio-economic benefits of CSOT schemes to communities. The cited sources interrogate the effectiveness of the programme in one way or the other but they do not consider the role of the media in constructing that particular effectiveness. It is this missing conception that inspired the immediate study. As pointed out earlier, the private media exposes the loopholes of the mechanism whilst the public media represent it positively. Analyzing the representation of the programme in media discourse will yield resounding results because media discourse is a multidisciplinary field. It is the subject of scrutiny in linguistics Talbot (2007). The study seeks to reveal that all that is regarded as reality is socially determined as a result representation should not be taken for granted in any case.

According to the researcher's knowledge there is not even one study that deals with the representation of the CSOT programme in media discourse from a linguistic approach. Attention is directed on analyzing the representation of the programme, the use of language and the

promoted ideologies by the two media houses involved in the current study. The privately owned and the state owned newspapers actually represent the scheme from different perspectives in a bid to protect and further their respective ideological inclinations. Protection of such ideologies usually drives the prominent participants to remain quiet when they are expected to clarify on certain issues like funds distribution.

Moving on, Fowler (1991) chooses to interpret news as something shaped by cultural, economic and political forces and not as a product of reality. Likewise, Van Dijk (1988) concedes that news is characterised as a frame through which the social world is routinely constructed and not as a mirror of reality of which may be corrected and biased. Media are regarded as the mirror and window. The media being the window, people see the world through it and being a mirror, it reflects the world again to the audiences Tuchman (1976). However, Tuchman (1976) also notes that it is problematic to regard the media as a window because the view depends on whether the window is large or small, has few or many panes, is opaque or clear, or faces the street or backyard. It is imperative to consider such insights because the representations of the CSOT programme by *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* are basically exhibiting political forces within the two presses. The media actively participate in social issues as the public media houses uphold the interests of the ruling party and the private media as noted by Atkins (2002) are there to watch the ills of the government. This concept indicates that the private media are associated with opposition parties. The role of media in society is a bit deviated for they seem to focus mainly on political ideologies.

Furthermore, several critical studies in many disciplines such as discourse studies, linguistics, semiotics and others have been inspired by media therefore its power is undeniable. Hall (1997) asserts that naturalization is a representational strategy designed to fix difference and thus secure

it forever. It is an attempt to halt inevitable slide of meaning to secure ideological closure. What is reported in newspapers can be naturalized to maintain powerful figures' dominance over the less powerful groups. Naturalization functions to reinforce the social power held by those in authority. It avoids discussion and the possibility of organizational change despite the idea that such change may bring about benefits to the organization. The underprivileged social groups do not challenge the ruling elites even if they are capable of coming up with better ways of implementing the CSOT programme within their communities. Similarly, responsible government officials situate communicative events as natural that cannot be alternated to accommodate other members' ideas. *The Herald* naturalizes the way it represents the CSOT programme whilst the *Zimbabwe Independent* neutralizes the same representation. The later indicates that there are alternative ways to representing the programme depending on its impact on the beneficiaries. According to Deetz (1992), naturalization functions to reinforce the social power held by those in authority. More precisely this implies that every representation is political. The percentage of profit to be availed by foreign investors for the indigenization programme was presented as something fixed but it has been proven that it can be altered because other participants are failing to meet that particular requirement and it is the reason why the CSOT programme is not functional in other communal areas up to date, *Zimbabwe Independent* (2014).

### **Theoretical framework**

The research is done under the lens of CDA. It is a multidisciplinary approach since it is not confined to any single theory. The fact that CDA incorporates ethical issues into practical issues differentiates it from the rest of discourse analysis frameworks. Textual analysis is one of the elements inclusive to CDA. This theoretical framework also accounts for historical, social and

cognitive contexts that contribute to text creation and production. A combination of these elements provides a better understanding of a particular discourse. Van Dijk (1993) asserts that CDA studies social forms like dominance, inequality, social power abuse and the way these are enacted, reproduced and resisted by talk and text in the social and political context.

As asserted earlier, CDA basically requires an account of intricate relationships between talk, power, social cognition, society, culture and true multidisciplinary. It is characterized by various principles for instance, its principles are problem oriented as a result it is necessarily interdisciplinary and eclectic Meyer and Wodak (2009). This perspective accommodates other scholars' views like Atkins (2002) who articulates that it is not easy to define critical discourse analysis in simple terms because it encompasses a number of tenets and uses a range of techniques. It focuses on issues of political power and also facilitates an analysis of identity, class, gender, race and ethnicity as crucial elements of culture. These components require analysis and examination to discover propensities that elevate domination and oppression in a particular society.

There are main tenets of CDA as propounded by Fairclough and Wodak (1997). CDA addresses social problems, it constitutes society and culture, it does ideological work, it is historical, it is a form of social action, discourse analysis is imperative and explanatory. Several scholars in CDA employ typical vocabulary featuring notions like dominance, hegemony, power, class, gender, reproduction, interests, social order and others.

CDA is a source of methods used in conducting empirical studies. These studies are concerned with the relations existing between discourse and society. The theory in question intends to unveil socio-political inequalities based on varied grounds whether religious, economic, and

political or gendered existing in a society. The theory draws on Gramsci's theory of hegemony which presents culture, society and politics as terrains of contestation between various groups and class blocs Holub (1992). Hegemony is whereby particular social groups struggle in many different ways for instance, ideologically to win the consent of other groups and achieve a kind of ascendancy in both thought and practice over them. Hegemony is never permanent, and is not reducible to a simple class model of society Hall (1997). Hegemony is entitled to a powerful group in a society and since power is something that can be removed from one group to another, so is hegemony.

The theory as well recognizes that culture is as much a determinant of the form of society as politics and the economy Dant (2003). Fairclough (1995:132) defines CDA as the study of

often opaque relationships of causality and determination between discursive practices, events or texts, and wider social and cultural-structures, relations and processes; to investigate how such practices, events and texts arise out of and are ideologically shaped by relations of power and struggles over power; and to explore how the opacity of these relationships between discourse and society is itself a factor securing power and hegemony.

It is a textual theory that concerns itself with the hidden images, words and statements that are employed to represent social events. Fairclough reveals that CDA is certainly aware of both social and cultural events and as a result it deals with particular connections existing between the use of language and the exercise of power. The theory is capable of relating the history and present events in analyzing contemporary issues covered in newspapers. *The Zimbabwe Independent* relates the reason for the establishment of the CSOT programme to historical reasons that it was a strategic campaign by the ruling party. *The Herald* links the relevance of the programme to the colonial regime where the indigenous people were systematically excluded from the mainstream economy of Zimbabwe.

Additionally, Huckin (2002) contends that CDA does not only demonstrate what is happening in the text but also notes what is missing from the text; why this particular selection, why here, why now? This notation points to the issue of media ownership whereby the producer would be guided by their established ideologies. The public media rarely produce texts that expose weaknesses of the ruling party whilst the private media are eager to let the audiences know the negative image of the ruling party.

## **2.4 Conclusion**

The researcher described literature review and the selected theory for the study in this chapter. It is accurately noted at this stage of the research that representation is not an innocent process hence what is produced by the *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* is subjective, ideological and political. Noted is the fact that CDA provides an understanding of the connection between historical or contemporary events and issues of power in society.

## **CHAPTER 3**

### **Research methodology**

#### **3.0 Introduction**

This chapter is concerned with the techniques that are employed by the researcher in collecting and analysing data during the course of the study. A wide range of methodological approaches have been established by scholars to assist researchers in designing their studies. This study is being informed by a qualitative research method. A prominent qualitative scholar like Bryman (2012) articulates that qualitative research is a research strategy that normally emphasizes words rather than quantification and analysis of data. Denzin and Lincoln (2000), propound that qualitative research is intended to deeply explore, understand and interpret social phenomena within its natural setting. Additionally, this particular methodology is exploited for it enables the researcher to explore why, when, where the CSOT was established and how is it actually meeting its objectives. Through the technique of textual analysis, the researcher is able to come up with relevant data to the study. Purposive sampling was regarded the most appropriate technique to establishing a manageable study as the researcher had to consider the quality of articles in relation to the study. The researcher also applied content analysis and critical discourse analysis on the selected articles in order to facilitate the examination of the inherent factors that impact on the representation of the CSOT programme by the two newspapers.

#### **3.1 Research instruments**

The researcher is determined to use textual data hence other data gathering instruments like interviews and questionnaires are not applicable. This study concerns itself with secondary sources that are newspaper articles. Observations are as well made through textual analysis of

relevant materials. The application of textual analysis to investigate the representation of CSOT programme by the *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald* yields different results. The two media houses were deliberately chosen in order to have a balanced representation of the CSOT programme. Since the *Zimbabwe Independent* is not being owned by the government, it constructs reality in a way that does not basically protect the reputation of the government. The audiences are given exposure to different political perspectives which are aired out by the two media houses. Due to the power struggle that exist between the two media houses it is necessary to consider representation of the programme from both private and public media. If the researcher had chosen only the public press, the other side of the coin was to be left unturned. The two newspapers represented different opinions about the scheme depending on the ideologies they intend to protect. The Herald as a state owned newspaper intends to promote the government based programmes like the indigenisation policy which is implemented through CSOTs. Its main ideology rests on people empowerment. On the other hand, the *Zimbabwe Independent* strives to air out the weaknesses of the government in the operational system of the CSOT programme. Textual analysis gives room to identify how powerful groups maintain dominance over the subordinated groups. The social problems of their time were addressed in different ways to prove that power is something that is contested.

It is fundamental to take note of population of the study as part and parcel of the research instruments. The field of media discourse incorporates private and public newspapers from which the two newspapers to be analysed in this research were selected. Public newspapers include *The Herald*, *The Sunday Mail*, *Chronicle*, *Sunday News* and many others. The privately owned newspapers are namely *The standard*, *Daily News*, *NewsDay*, *The Zimbabwe Independent* and many more. To be more specific, the selected media houses are categorized under sub

population of the study. This location restricts the researcher to use any other newspapers except for the *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald*.

### **3.2 Sampling procedures for data collection**

Kumar (2005) defines a sample as a subgroup of the population the researcher is interested in. In this case all Zimbabwean print media constitute the research population and the subgroup population is the *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald*.

The articles used were reported in 2014 from 23 January to 18 October by the media houses in question. The researcher used seven articles, four from *The Herald* and the other five from the *Zimbabwe Independent*. The remarkable divergence that appeared in the coverage of the same programme is what inspired the researcher to select these particular articles. The divergence is remarkable in that the two media houses have different partisan interests. The state owned newspaper serves the interests of the ruling government whilst the private owned one in collaboration with the opposition parties traces the ills of the government. As a result, the *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald* contribute to constructing different social views and beliefs of the audiences through their representation of the programme. The period was deliberately chosen so as to accurately locate some of the hidden agenda behind the establishment of the programme. According to the content of the articles it appears that the programme is yet to meet the stipulated objectives implying that a lot of power abuse is being practiced by the ruling class. The research will pay attention to the representation of discourses like poverty, empowerment, and development and how they relate to the socio- political context in Zimbabwe.

The researcher used one of the non-probability sampling schemes namely judgmental or purposive sampling. According to Kumar (2005) non-probability sampling does not comply with the theory of probability in the choice of components from the sampling population. Judgmental or purposive sampling entails that the researcher is responsible of judging as to who can supply the best information to achieve the objectives of the research. The current research relies on newspaper articles from *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent*. The researcher realized that these two presses represent the CSOT programme in ways that allow for achievement of the research objectives.

Purposive sampling assists the researcher to develop something about which only a few is known. The assertion implies that the researcher is able to interrogate and expose the underlying ideologies in as far as the immediate study is concerned. Also, population components are chosen basing on their availability. For instance, the researcher may use certain population elements because of their personal judgment that they are representative Field (2005). Purposive sampling enabled the researcher to select media texts from the *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald* on the representation of the CSOT programme. Kumar (2005) asserts that sampling as a process is associated with advantages and disadvantages.

#### Advantages

- It saves time since the researcher only concentrates on what they judge to be relevant to the study.
- It is cheaper as it saves money and other human resources.

#### Disadvantages

- The researcher estimates the information about the population's characteristics.

- Sampling compromise the level of accuracy in the researcher's findings.

The purpose of this study is to analyse voice and silence in the representation of the CSOT programme in two of the leading newspapers, *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent*. The researcher will as well focuses on the significance of power relations between the two newspapers. The researcher was attracted to these two newspapers by considering the detailed articles in the representation of the CSOT programme as an ongoing process. Therefore all data to be used was collected depending on its quality in relation to representation of the programme by the media houses in question. The researcher used nine articles, four from *The Herald* and the other five from the *Zimbabwe independent*. The remarkable difference that appeared in the coverage of the same programme is what inspired the researcher to select these particular articles. The Herald romanticised the effectiveness of the programme in that it mostly outlined infrastructure development that has been achieved by some of the established CSOTs. However the abuse of funds due to lack of transparency during transactions between foreign investors and the respective CSOT is left unattended. This is where the private newspaper takes a stance to awaken the audiences so that they realize limitations of the programme. The selected articles reported on three CSOTs namely, Marange, Zvishavane and Tongogara. The period was deliberately chosen so as to accurately locate some of the hidden agenda behind the establishment of the programme. According to the content of the selected articles from the *Zimbabwe Independent* it appears that the programme is yet to meet the stipulated objectives implying that a lot of power abuse is being practiced by the ruling class. Attention is paid to the representation of discourses like poverty, empowerment, and development and how they relate to the socio- political context in Zimbabwe.

### **3.3 Limitations of methodology**

A couple of limitations of qualitative research method have been exposed by Bryman (2012). It was realized that qualitative research as a method is too subjective. The research itself is prone to individual bias since findings mainly rely on the researcher's views. In the case of the immediate study, this notion holds water because the nature of the employed methods do not allow for other people's views. Only the researcher presents what they consider significant throughout the study. Criticism against qualitative methodology stipulates that it has problems of generalization. The scope of the findings of qualitative investigations is limited for instance; the selected newspaper articles from only two media houses are regarded as representing the manner in which the CSOT programme is reported by all other public and private media houses.

## CHAPTER 4

### Data presentation and interpretation

#### 4.0 Introduction

Data presentation and interpretation in this chapter is primarily based on data gathering methods and theoretical framework highlighted in chapter 3. Purposive sampling facilitated the researcher to come up with relevant material for the study. This chapter establishes a basis of the next which concentrates on recommendations and conclusions of the research. CDA, as the selected theoretical framework for the study, is employed in the analysis of the selected articles. Imperative to note is the fact that findings are presented and interpreted in a qualitative form implying that the researcher relies on descriptive interpretation and analysis.

The researcher managed to come up with seven newspaper articles from *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* dating from 23 January to 18 2014. Three articles were selected from the *Zimbabwe Independent* and the other four from *The Herald*. Also, the selected articles incorporate two newspaper media genres: namely, hard news story and feature report. *The Herald* has three hard news stories which were selected for analysis because hard news cover public events like actions done by the government as well as social conditions that affect the environment and economy. News covering social conditions and the economy are actually relevant for the current study since the CSOT programme is primarily concerned with socio-economic transformation. The other article is a feature report which has the advantage of reporting related events in a continuous manner thereby giving the readers the requisite background of recent events. These articles are constructed by the pro-government media to perpetuate ZANU PF ideologies such as the usefulness, legitimacy of the CSOT and they

represent the programme as a vehicle of empowerment especially in mining communities. The *Zimbabwe Independent* however, has a different ideological inclination altogether. Their ideologies cover the impractical nature of the CSOT programme, and irrationality of the programme. The *Zimbabwe Independent* articles include three hard news stories. The three hard news stories were selected because they focused on the same CSOTs covered by *The Herald* thereby creating a platform where the analyst would be able to compare and contrast the employment of lexico-grammatical features by two different presses.

## **4.1 Data presentation**

The researcher takes a thematic approach in data presentation. The selected newspaper articles reveal a number of themes in the representation of the CSOT programme. It is noted that the *The Herald* articles stress three positive themes in their representation. On the other hand the *Zimbabwe Independent* articles emphasise two negative themes concerning the programme.

### **4.1.1 A vehicle of Empowerment**

*The Herald* articles are based on sources from authoritative figures almost all of them stressing the crucial role of the CSOT programme as a vehicle through which people empowerment can be achieved. It is also represented as an ideal programme that guards against exploitation of natural resources. *The Herald* article of 23 January 2014 titled 'Govt probes Community Share Ownership Trusts,' was concerned with investigating the operational system of the programme in every resource rich area where the programme was implemented. The focus is on finding out the obstacles hindering the proper functionality of the programme. The government's quest for investigation was aroused by allegations of fund abuse and failure by companies like diamond firms in Marange and Zimunya to honour their pledges. The then responsible Minister of

Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment, Francis Nhema, said that they were carrying out audits to find out the established agreements and reasons why some companies were not complying with the requirements of the programme. The programme is represented as not fully embraced by the Diamond Mining firms who failed to honour their pledges towards its functionality. The launch of the CSOTs in 2012 by President Robert Mugabe was based on the programme's ability to empower the marginalized communities. People in some of the resource rich areas are directly benefiting from their God given resources because the respective foreign investors fully implemented the programme.

#### **4.1.2 Legitimacy of CSOT programme**

*The Herald* article of 12 March 2014 titled 'Pay up, diamond mining firms told,' focused on the legitimacy of the CSOT programme. It captures the issue of companies being warned to pay up what they promised and operationalize the CSOTs launched by the President over the elapsed three years. It was reported that funding in line with the empowerment regulations requires mining firms to dispose 10 percent shareholding to CSOTs. As a result, it is the quest of the government that all foreign based mining companies should honour their pledges. Legitimacy of the CSOT programme is reiterated throughout the four *Herald* articles. There is repeated reference to the launching by President Mugabe. The establishment of CSOT is based on Section 14B of the Economic Empowerment (General) Regulations of 2010. Its regulations state that communities should benefit from the exploitation of their natural resources by foreign owned companies. Therefore, several officials urged the companies to make contributions towards the CSOT programme because it was mandatory for them to give to the communities especially in the case of Marange and Zimunya.

#### **4.1.3 Usefulness of the CSOT programme**

Furthermore, the same article of 23 January 2014 reveals the usefulness of the programme as it enabled infrastructure development in the case of Tongogara which received \$10 million from Unkie. Through the implementation of the programme, Tongogara communities managed to build a mortuary, drilled more than 199 boreholes, and built a school. They bought a grader, as well, that is used to renovate roads in Shurugwi. It is also noted that Zvishvane, Mhondoro and Ngezi are some of the areas in which infrastructure development was achieved through the implementation of the CSOT programme. This usefulness is captured in the other two articles titled ‘Communities mining big’ and ‘Pay up, diamond firms are told’. In areas where companies failed to fulfil their promises of paying \$10 million towards the CSOT programme there is no infrastructure development.

#### **4.1.4 Irrationality of the CSOT programme**

The *Zimbabwe Independent* conveys negative attributes of the CSOT programme to their readership. The article of 17 April 2014 entitled ‘Chaos mars community share ownership trusts’ represents the programme as irrational as the launched CSOTs are being destroyed by confusion and disorder. Its irrationality is revealed when the responsible ministers failed to coordinate so that they achieve one goal for instance; Kasukuwere and his successor, Nhema, gave different statements concerning documents for the establishment of Marange-Zimunya CSOT. Nhema says there is no written communication between the ministry and the foreign investors whilst Kasukuwere acknowledges its existence. Another instance exposing the irrationality of the programme is captured in the article of 16 May 2014 when Kasukuwere fails to appear before the

portfolio committee and clarify issues concerning documentations of agreements between the Ministry and foreign investors.

#### **4.1.5 Impracticality of the CSOT programme**

The *Zimbabwe Independent* article of 17 April 2014 reports that the CSOTs are associated with controversy and confusion as people yearn for clarification on the exact amount paid to date. President Mugabe is suspected of having been given fake cheques during the launches. It also captures the voice of Muchacha who says the diamond companies were working with Mushowe who provided his bank account basing on the fact that he had working relationship with Marange-Zimunya Community Trust. Some of the foreign investors say they were not aware of the trust. Diamond companies claim to have agreed on paying \$1, 5 million each instead of \$10 million as expected by the government. ‘Kasukuwere avoids grilling by legislators’ is a headline of the *Zimbabwe Independent* article of 16 May 2014. The story portrays the programme as unworkable and useless because it is associated with unclarified issues. The four diamond mines denied their involvement in the setting of the trust. They also said they never enter into written agreements on paying \$10 million each. The press also states that out of 59 CSOTs established three years ago only fifteen are functional

#### **4.2 Data Interpretation**

The newspapers used distinctive lexico-grammatical choices and these linguistic choices are purposefully employed to elicit both positive and negative attitudes towards the government’s empowerment agenda through CSOT programme depending on the sources. The issue of sources incorporates Fairclough’s (2003) intertextuality which encompasses summarised information from different sources. The noted themes in the data presentation section are brought out through

the use of lexico-grammatical features of which were determined by the historical and cultural factors surrounding the establishment of CSOTs. Some of the linguistic resources used include active or passive voice, direct or indirect quotations and naming. This kind of linguistic resource manipulation influences how the audiences are likely to view the CSOT programme. Hackett (1984) views language as a symbolic system used to represent social reality. Language plays multiple roles in communicative events for it does not only depict events covered by the media but also signifies the mental attitude towards the issue or event (McCullagh 2002). The *Zimbabwe Independent* challenges the pro-government ideologies as it gives an alternative representation to the programme, at times necessarily without even bothering to cite authentic sources. On the other hand, *The Herald* perpetuates ZANU PF's partisan interests which press on to obtaining political goals like acquisition of popularity and support from the general populace.

#### **4.2.1 A vehicle of Empowerment**

Considering *The Herald* of 23 January 2014 titled 'Govt probes Community Share Ownership Trusts' the government is said to be investigating the established CSOTs but of concern is Marange-Zimunya following the allegations of abuse of funds and failure by some companies to honour pledges they made. The CSOT programme is considered the only sure way through which the marginalized people can be empowered hence the government is seriously concerned with its functionality.

The active verb 'probes' in the headline is catchy and actually represent the CSOT as a fundamental programme which needs to be thoroughly investigated. Investigation is done in a bid to find out and rectify the wrongs. The government's business here is to perfect the role of the programme as a vehicle of empowerment. The programme seems to be considered the most

effective means of empowering the marginalized people since the headline exposes the government's concern in a context where social injustice and power abuse are taking place. Social injustice is practiced by either influential people within the communities by abusing public funds or by foreign investors as they decide not to dispose 10 percent shareholding to the deserving beneficiaries. *The Herald* shapes the audience's perception pertaining to this matter hence they realize the fundamental role of the programme.

Though the programme is associated with issues of fund abuse, the press strives to dismiss this impression so that the public remain positive about the intended role of the programme. The noun 'allegation' used by the reporter is giving room to the responsible participants for affirming or denying the matter of fund abuse because they are aligned to the ruling party. The issue of media ownership in this case determines the way in which reality is constructed. Mainly because *The Herald* is pro-government, the reporter does not take a specific position to affirm the abuse of funds contributed towards the programme. The aspect of explicit naming is avoided, the accused are said to be 'chiefs and local politicians'. This was done to make the accusation baseless. Consequently the beneficiaries would remain hoping that the programme is capable of changing their poor living conditions. This lack of voice where clarification is needed is aimed at covering the press' underlying ideologies such as covering up ZANU PF scandals which are disrupting the role of the programme as a vehicle of empowerment. The historical factor determining the reporter's lexico-grammatical choice is that ZANU PF is the architect of the programme hence they should prove their commitment to its success and effectiveness as a vehicle of empowerment.

Furthermore, direct speech was used as one of the reporter's sources for instance,

On the allegation that influential people are abusing the funds, Minister Nhema said “it will only be fair for us to make a comment after completion of this process. There are some grey areas and it is premature to make a comment now”

The effect was to give credibility to the claims made by the newspaper. In an interview, the then- minister of Youth Indegenisation and Economic Empowerment, Cde Nhema could not give straight forward answers for instance; he uses a noun phrase grey area which implies that there is no clear position concerning the role of the CSOT programme as a vehicle of empowerment. This was deliberately chosen to avoid giving detailed information to the interviewer because clarification could have marked the onslaught of ZANU PF’s ideology treating the programme as a vehicle of empowerment. It is clear that lack of explanation to clarify pertinent issues serves to protect the programme from exposing its limitations to the public.

There is only representation from the government perspective by authoritative sources. *The Herald* does not lose hope in the role of the programme as a vehicle of empowerment. There are instances of mismanagement and corruption but Minister Nhema is not yet convinced that the programme is unworkable. He considers the establishment of facts through investigation as the justifiable way forward hence he is not prepared to make any comment at the moment. In a way he is trying to dismiss allegations that the programme is failing to fulfill its mandate due to the funds being abused. The way in which this reality is conveyed to the audience through media is linked to Hall’s (1997) constructionist approach to language meaning where representation does not imitate reality but instead produces it. Language is regarded as a social construct which means that it is a produced means of communication that has been invented to convey meaning and influence readers in how they might view the world. Power entails the ability to control and influence another individual’s thinking, attitudes and behaviours. These newspaper communicative events reinforce Tuchman’s (1978) idea that it is problematic to regard media as

a mirror of reality. The programme, since 2012, could not effect tangible positive development in Marange and Zimunya communities. The production context and the reception of the text determined how the producer would depict the ideas to the audiences.

In *The Herald* of 18 October titled ‘Community Share Ownership Trust money abused’, Nhema admits the abuse of CSOTs funds as revealed by the government audit but he at first highlights that

...most of CSOTs set up by the Government in 2012 lacked business acumen to utilize seed money ...while some of the funds have been abused

The conjunction ‘while’ here shows that emphasis is put on lack of business acumen and not on the abuse of funds. The headline ‘Community Share Ownership Trust money abused’ draws the reader’s attention expecting to get enlightened on how the trust funds were abused but only to find that the matter is not even developed. Instead the reporter shifts focus and concentrate on lack of business skills as the main drawback in the day to day running of the CSOTs. The statement connotes that the government initiated a workable programme but its administration lacked business skills. Thus, the CSOTs themselves are represented as vehicles of empowerment. It is only their mismanagement by a few corrupt and wayward individuals which is represented as detrimental to achieving the intended role. Manipulation of language facilitates the process of representing the programme positively.

*The Herald* of 23 January 2014 also intends to perpetuate the government’s ideology of depicting the CSOT programme as a vehicle of people empowerment.

The trusts were launched by President Mugabe in 2012 and were expected to transform communities in which mining companies operate. Companies pledged to fund Marange Zimunya Share Ownership to the tune of US\$ 50 million in 2013 but reports say only US\$400 000 has been paid up to date.

The extract emphasizes the intended role of the CSOT programme as a vehicle of people empowerment. The passive verb ‘launched’ indicates initiation of a programme that would enable the marginalized rural people to directly participate in the mainstream economy. ‘Transform’ is a verb that suggests a change in appearance hence it is not an assumption that Marange and Zimunya communities would get empowered through this particular programme. The conjunction ‘but’ was tactfully used to introduce the unexpected failure of the companies to fund Marange-Zimunya trust. The selected wording gives their readership hope that the programme’s intended role would induce foreign investors pay the full amount.

On 12 March 2014, *The Herald’s* top story was entitled ‘Pay up, diamond firms told’. The article gives the historical context of the issue being represented in the lead paragraph to establish the seriousness and relevance of the message. The payment by mining firms was prolonged for three years since establishment of the programme effectively hindering the success of the indigenous empowerment. By forcing the mines to ‘pay up’, Zimbabweans were pictured as championing the role of the programme as a vehicle of empowerment. The collective noun ‘Zimbabweans’ shows nationality and implies that the programme’s role is appreciated all citizens.

Social commentator Mr. Godwin Mureriwa was quoted saying,

If they can’t fulfill that then I do not see why the Government should be tolerant. They must know that there is competition out there. We have to be fair in sharing profits from diamonds by ensuring that communities benefit

This kind of discourse was deliberately constructed to dismiss the previous conflicting statements concerning abused funds in *The Herald* of 23 January. As Fairclough (1985) defines discourses as bodies of knowledge that shape people, the ruling party produce discourses that

actually shape people's perception towards social events. Considering the above extract, Mureriwa' presupposes that the government has connection with a lot of foreign investors who are prepared to settle in Zimbabwe and comply with the indigenization policy which treats the CSOT programme as a vehicle of empowerment. The emphasis is on the need to make communities benefit from their natural resources through the CSOT programme. The underlying factor is to win support from those particular communities since the use of words is political. The application of the pronoun 'we' by Mureriwa implicate eradication of divisions and represent the nation as united therefore everyone regard the CSOT programme as the only means through which indigenous people can be empowered. The negative morpheme 'not' in the extract is strategically used to instil fear in the mind of foreign investors. All this effort is contributed to connote the essentiality of the CSOT programme in as far as people empowerment is concerned. Manipulation of linguistic devices provides explicit evidence that the government in conjunction with the CSOT programme have big plans for the betterment of rural communities.

#### **4.2.2 Legitimacy of the CSOT programme**

In the article of 12 March the reporter takes a favourable stance towards ZANU PF prominent figures like Kasukuwere and the Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment Parliamentary Committee mainly because the reporter's choice of verbs has to be positive or neutral.

... Saviour Kasukuwere yesterday cleared the air, saying the launch of the Marange-Zimunya CSOT was done above board and all responsible ministries were involved and represented at the launch.

The committee advises the press to contact Minister Kasukuwere... to seek clarification from them.

From the above cited examples, the verb 'advises' and the metaphor 'clear the air' show that the reporter is aligned to the participants' perspectives. 'Clear the air' shows Kasukuwere clarified

the nature of the CSOT programme as legal as its implementation in Marange and Zimunya areas was witnessed by a number of ministries. The analysis of lexical choices exhibits that the CSOT is presented as a well-thought out legitimate programme which should not be disrupted by those who decide not to honour their pledges. The reader is persuaded to focus on the companies which are failing to meet the requirements of the indigenization policy rather than the impractical nature of the programme.

Moving on, *The Herald* article of 12 March perpetuates the legitimacy of the CSOT programme.

Community Share Ownership Trusts were established in terms of section 14B of the Economic Empowerment (General) Regulations of 2010 which provide that local communities whose natural resources are being exploited by any qualifying business must be guaranteed shareholding in that business.

There is reference to when the policy was formulated in order to legalise the programme and represent it to their readership as different from an overnight event. The historical background of the programme is regarded as an anchor to its legitimacy. *The Herald* of 14 March 2014 represents the CSOTs as having a firm regulatory security that guards against interference of politicians. This is captured in the direct quotation from Chief Chimhofu.

Politicians have been respecting the chiefs and all they have done is chip in with advice which can we accept or reject.

The juxtaposition of antonyms ‘accept’ and ‘reject’ implies that the traditional leaders were lawfully given total control over the operational system of the CSOTs. However, this might have been done to gain their hope and confidence in the party because after 2013 harmonised elections, the government began to change their terms and acted as if they were against uneconomic projects implemented by chiefs in their communities.

Moreover, there are instances where the programme is used by politicians, as a dominant social group, manipulates the ordinary people as later on revealed that some politicians accorded Mberengwa district the right to equally share the funds with Zvishavane CSOT without the Trustees' consent. This suggests that apart from its legitimacy, the programme was as well used as is a political gimmick since its terms and conditions are not stable. The features writer employs figurative language when he says '... if all goes by 'the book' which connotes the legality of the CSOT programme.

#### **4.2.3 Usefulness of the Programme**

*The Herald* analysis of 14 March 2014 was entitled 'Communities mining big'. In this article the reader is attracted by the headline that implies development in communities through mining activities. The term 'big' actually implies that the CSOT programme is ideal as it is resulting in fruitful development projects within communities. The article exposes the usefulness of the programme as it facilitated infrastructure development in resource rich areas. The fruitfulness of the CSOT programme is juxtaposed with the exploitative nature of mining companies. There is use of assurance language

'There won't be ghost towns after the cessation of mining activities this time around...'

This kind of linguistic creativity keeps the public aligned to the programme as a useful mechanism to safeguard sustainability of mining towns after cessation of mining activities. The metaphor 'Ghost towns' suggests a deserted place hence evokes the reader to develop a negative attitude towards foreign investors who are not contributing towards the programme. The whole process of representation is ideological; the construction of reality is done to make the public discover the usefulness of the programme.

Chief Chimhofu who is chairman of the ZCSOT was quoted saying,

‘If we look at it, the idea of indigenization, it is the best thing to happen to Zimbabwe...’

The adjective ‘best’ in this complex clause is used to convince readers that the government carries out ideal programmes. The idea of indigenization is where the CSOT programme emanates. The government representatives find a way through manipulation of language to justify the events initiated by the government which are subject to criticism. Chief Chimhofu is inclined to ZANU PF as he acknowledges the usefulness of the programme. He is representing a political stance of all other chiefs. Interesting is the fact that chiefs were appointed for chairmanship in the CSOTs. The indigenization programme is fighting against exploitation of natural resources by foreigners therefore emphasizing the usefulness of the programme.

#### **4.2.4 Irrationality of the CSOT programme**

The *Zimbabwe Independent* news story of 17 April 2014 was titled ‘Chaos mars share ownership trusts.’ This article advances the private media’s ideology that the CSOT programme is irrational as it is characterised by both confusion and disorder. The active verb ‘mars’ in the headline, attracts the reader to grasp what the story is all about. The verb provides a clear depiction of the state of CSOTs as they are associated with imperfection. The readers would be curious to acquire the causes of extreme confusion in government programmes. The reporter employs the noun ‘chaos’ to format hope of anything positive concerning CSOTs. A negative representation of the programme suggests that it is irrational.

There is continuous use of terms that connote negative attributes of the programme in the lead of the article.

GROWING controversy and confusion over the community share ownership trusts has hit the country, leaving Zimbabweans yearning for clarity on the exact amount pledged by mining companies and the total amount paid to date...

The nouns ‘controversy’ and ‘confusion’ reinforce the notion of chaos in implementation of the programme as stated in the headline. This kind of representation negates the state of CSOTs thereby giving an impression that implementation of the trusts is half-baked. The phrase ‘Growing controversy and confusion...’ provides the lead with the context in which the news was produced. The lead implicates that the reporter considered the historical context of the event as something subjected to continuation. The adjective ‘growing’ and the verb ‘leaving’ perpetuate the reporter’s interest to shape the readers understanding and perception that the programme is irrational as there is nothing meaningful within the established CSOTs.

The statement ‘...Zimbabweans yearning for clarity’ suggests that the programme is irrational since citizens are longing for what exactly transpires within the CSOTs. It seems there is no one to update the masses about the transactions made by foreign investors to the CSOTs yet the funds are meant for the public. There is no clear operational system within the CSOTs therefore the programme was not evaluated before implementation. The cited lexico-grammatical choices enhance a negative picture of the programme as something that was initiated haphazardly. The reporter shows collective identity and unity of the participants so that the press appears to be concerned with the welfare of their citizens.

#### **4.2.5 Impracticality of the CSOT programme.**

The aspect of naming as a linguistic device entails that the manner in which people are named can uphold ideologies. By so doing the reporter’s political goals are attained since opposition parties affiliate the private newspapers as their mouth piece. The reporter as well is persuading the audience to buy their argument. Moreover, the way individuals are depicted in a text or even

after giving quotes also demonstrate two different pictures. The following extract constructs a different picture than just saying Brian Raftopoulos.

Director of Research and Advocacy in the Solidarity Peace Trust, Brian Raftopoulos said although the initiative remains noble, Zanu PF has used the controversial programme to gain popularity. “By implementing this controversial programme, Zanu PF managed to claw back some space which it lost to the MDCs in the 2008 disputed elections and increase its support base,” Raftopoulos said. “It is unfortunate that this indigenisation has exposed the state itself as being owned by a particular party and that Zanu PF used this process to spearhead its campaigns without assessing how communities will benefit,” he said.

The character is given by designation in order to establish credentials which facilitate reception of the quoted statements. Readers become convinced that the indigenization programme is controversial and has been manipulated by ZANU PF as a political gimmick mainly because it has been testified by someone with expertise in matters to do with politics. The fact that it was used as a political gimmick automatically points to the impractical nature of the CSOT programme because its purpose was to attract the public to supporting ZANU PF as a political part and not to improve economic growth. The historical context revealed in the extract proves that discourse exists and operates within a particular context. The reporter with his partisan interests cites a prominent figure to enable him to convey the idea that CSOT programme is not actually successful in empowering communities. This implies his opposition nature to the ruling party and in a way he strives to impose it to the general populace. The phrase ‘2008 disputed elections’ reveals a historical event which at one point exposed ZANU PF as a corrupt party. Consequently, the CSOT programme as part of the indigenization process is unworkable because it was meant for attracting the masses to vote for ZANU PF before 2013 elections.

The reporter also applies the intentional approach to language meaning whereby he manipulates sources that enable him to convey his intended message of portraying the programme as impractical. In other words he gathers reality that serves his interests for example, when he says,

Diamond firms also said they were in direct contact with the minister of State for Manicaland Province Christopher Mushowe, who provided his bank account, effectively sidestepping the Marange-Zimunya Community Share Ownership Trust. Anjin Investment board member Munyaradzi Machacha said they had always worked with Mushowe. “The trust has not approached us. Mushowe is the one we have been talking to. He was the contact person. “He gave us the bank account. We have not had any meeting with Marange-Zimunya Community Trust,” Machacha reported to parliament.’

The statement ‘who provided his bank account’ reveals that Mushowe as an individual provided a company with a personal bank account because if the account was meant for trust funds they should have been given it in a formal set up like a meeting in the presence of board members. He abused his political power by making public funds personal. This event witnesses the unworkable nature of the programme since the availed funds are personalized. The source is authentic in the readers’ eyes because he is part and parcel of the foreign investors in Marange. Hence direct speech attracts the reader to truthfulness of the reporter’s statements. ZANU PF members are corrupt and they do not care about the vulnerable rural communities as they turn the programme unworkable. In every represented event it is noted that historical factors are made reference to through intertextuality.

The *Zimbabwe Independent* article of 1 August 2014 entitled ‘Banks Indigenise’ reveals the impractical nature of the indigenization programme. However the reporter shifts the reader’s focus and captures the empowerment strategy implemented through CSOT programme as illogical and impractical considering the number of unfunctional CSOTs at the moment.

Of the 61 CSOTs set up, only 15 are up and running with the remaining 46 in their formative stages and still to get seed capital

Implementation of the CSOT programme is slow and might not be successful in all targeted areas. The statement ‘formative stage and still to get seed capital’ destroys the reader’s hope in the functionality of these particular trusts.

The *Zimbabwe Independent* of 16 May 2014 captures the story of Kasukuwere avoiding the indigenization portfolio committee to provide any evidence for the establishment of Marange-Zimunya CSOT. Zhangazha reports that the diamond companies asserted that the Minister made a ‘gentleman’s agreement’ and others even add that they were ‘not involved in the trust’. The article exposes reality that negates the CSOTs as a failing economic mechanism. If the reader is to consider the time when the programme was initiated and only to be informed that nothing has been developed in Marange and Zimunya areas they are bound to realize the impracticality of the programme. ‘Gentlemen’s agreement’ implies that the programme is not taken seriously and even reduced to a self-aggrandizement tool.

The reporter represents Kasukuwere, a prominent government figure by using ambiguous words like ‘grilling’ and ‘summon’ that confine him to torture and guiltiness respectively. His negative reputation cartwheel the ideology that the CSOT programme are failing to meet the intended role due to corrupt Ministers.

### **4.3 Conclusion**

Considering the preceding analysis of newspaper articles from the two print media houses, it is evidence enough that the reporters tend to utilize objective reporting through partial coverage of communicative events and certain language that is characterized subjectivity which results in

biased news. The privately owned newspaper negates the CSOT programme and the indigenization policy at large as they use headlines such as ‘Chaos mars community share ownership trusts’ implying that everything about economic empowerment is in total confusion and disorder. Another headline that points to negativity towards the government’s policies is the article titled ‘Kasukuwere avoids grilling by legislators’ the language used understate the CSOT programme. They as well employ lexico-grammatical features that convey negativity towards the CSOT programme as illustrated by the analyst.

Furthermore, partisan reportage is also revealed in *The Herald* which continuously employs lexico-grammatical resources that connote positive attitude towards the fundamental role of the CSOT programme as a vehicle of people empowerment. They constructed headlines like ‘Communities mining big’ not allowing the audience the critical truth. It was unraveled that the two presses struggle for political power for they tend to represent the CSOT programme in almost opposing ways.

The papers take an intentional approach to language meaning in order to impose their perspectives on the reader. *The Herald’s* sources are rarely relying on other people like international economic figures, local economists and deserving beneficiaries of the programme. Rather their articles are populated by ZANU PF officials. Total marginalisation of the economists enables the party to disempower whatever opinions they might raise therefore implicating a particular level of bias. This kind of reportage gives the audience a monotonous representation of the same ZANU PF officials’ views on the CSOT programme.

The reportage of the programme by the *Zimbabwe Independent* indicates opposition to the government as it was characterized by subjective language mostly attacking the government and

its ZANU PF officials for corruption and poor foresight which caused them to implement an irrational and unworkable programme. The privately owned paper represented the programme as something impractical and a political gimmick. In the same breath, the *Zimbabwe Independent's* coverage discourse seems to be an attack based on irrationality for they rarely represent the community development achieved through the CSOT programme without criticising its architects.

The struggle for power that is possession of controlling influence is evidenced by both papers since they intend to deny the reader the right to pay attention to the voices and arguments of the other press. In other words each press stands as an ideal informer. In a way this kind of representation reveals the political positions of the private and the public newspapers. This again rationalizes the deliberate divergence from truth as the aim to persuade public opinion. Representation was actually used as a tool to manipulate the reader's way of thinking. Representation of the CSOT programme by the two papers exhibit partisan interests for each press. Consequently, they are driven away from reporting the truth but construct the truth that would earn them support from the readers. Power struggle is revolving around the two presses as they are selling different political ideologies. The presses put much effort in the construction of reality to achieve the goal of shaping the public perception. *The Herald* proved to be advancing the government's indigenization policy no matter how it proved to be failing while the *Zimbabwe Independent* attacks it as irrational and proving to fail.

The assertion that the unique role of media is to help the audiences to construct specific versions of reality is of great importance. The media as pointed out in the earlier chapters construct reality and shape their audiences' worldview. Hall's (1997) constructionist approach to language

meaning as held in the second chapter of the research has been utilized by the newspapers. This approach views representation as a process where meaning is socially constructed. Reality does not exist but rather constructed by human beings. Also media ownership determined what kind of discourses would be produced by the two newspapers. Talbot (2007) defines discourses as bodies of knowledge that shape people. The issue of knowledge is strongly linked to power; in dissemination of this issue both *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* claim to be knowledgeable hence the existence of power struggle between the two media houses. The powerful social groups including the ruling party are competing to instil reality in the readers' mind set.

## CHAPTER 5

### Conclusion

#### 5.0 Introduction

The present chapter sums up the whole research outlining the focus of the preceding chapters. The researcher highlights the salient observations made in the study. The chapter also proposes recommendations to some of the problems raised in the entire study.

##### 5.1 Summary of the study

The *Zimbabwe Independent* and *The Herald* represent the CSOT programme in divergent ways. The study unravelled the power struggles between the private and public media through the manner in which they represent the programme. The researcher employed purposive sampling to come up with relevant material for the study. The selected articles include two media genres namely the hard news story and feature report. In total seven (7) articles were sampled from both the two newspapers. Three articles were selected from the *Zimbabwe Independent* and the other four from *The Herald*. Sampling enabled the researcher to note that the coverage of the CSOT programme was no longer frequent as it was before 2013 elections. Language used in the selected articles were analysed with a specific focus on highlighting how it was manipulated by reporters of the respective newspapers to advance their ideological inclination.

The researcher realized that the private and the public media strategically employed specific lexico-grammatical choices in the depiction of the CSOT programme. The analysis of these linguistic devices enabled the researcher to find out that representation of this particular programme by *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* were meant to convey different

partisan interests. It was the quest of this research to discover the role of language in the representation of the CSOT programme.

The intentional and constructionist approaches to the representation of meaning were used by both newspapers to reveal their power relations. The *Zimbabwe Independent* articles conveyed a negative attitude towards the representation of the CSOT programme. Such negative attitudes included the representation of the programme as both impractical and irrational. Whilst on the other hand, *The Herald* exposed positivity towards the same programme. This included the representation of the programme as a useful, legitimate and a vehicle for government empowerment, among others. Here media ownership determined the way the two print media houses represented the programme. It can be deduced that the private media affiliates with opposition parties whilst the public media aligned with the ruling party of which is the architect of the programme.

## **5.2 Conclusions of the study**

Representation is not an innocent process. It is a process which is inflected and implicated with specific power dynamics. It entails power struggle between the media houses. Language plays a central role in the social construction these powerful dynamics. The researcher realized that the *Zimbabwe Independent* is a mouth-piece of the opposition parties as they despise the operational system of CSOT programme which is part of indigenization. Different lexico-grammatical features enabled each press to convey the programme in a way that protects its ideologies. The *Zimbabwe Independent* represents the programme as something impractical and irrational as it was used as a political gimmick by ZANU PF. They believe that the programme is destined for failure because it was implemented without necessarily consultation of targeted marginalized

communities. On the other hand, *The Herald* treats the programme as a vehicle of people empowerment of which guards against exploitation of natural resources by foreign investors. The noted divergence in the representation of the programme was facilitated by employment of different lexico-grammatical features by the reporters who mainly intend to perpetuate their partisan interests. By so doing the media has the power to shape the public understands and perception of the world view.

### **5.3 Recommendations of the study**

The powerful social groups should not fight for power at the expense of the public. It is actually detrimental to the marginalized people who expect empowerment through implementation of the CSOT programme. The deserving beneficiaries are basically disturbed by diverging representation of the programme. As a result, both presses should not take for granted the fact that language has the power to shape people's understanding of the world view. The use of subjective language by both presses may lead the readers to lose nationalist aspirations.

The obligation of media is to inform and educate the public reliably concerning issues of empowerment since most of the people in resource rich areas live in abject poverty. Therefore, the ruling party should try to be transparent to the masses on issues to do with the economy even if they face criticism because it helps them to rectify errors.

The presses should not be selective when choosing news sources because the issue of avoiding relevant participants is costly to the masses and results in biased news. This kind of news sourcing is dangerous because the practical facts would remain hidden thereby suppressing the success of noble programmes like the CSOT programme.

#### 5.4 Limitations of the study

The research is limited to only two media houses, *The Herald* and the *Zimbabwe Independent* and the ways in which each press represent the CSOT programme is considered to be universal to all public and private media respectively. The study could not use all media genres since the programme was no longer frequently talked about after 2013 presidential elections. The editorials could have provided the research with more insight in the representation of the programme since the editorial column explicitly show the ideological inclination of the newspaper. Also, the nature of the study does not accommodate other people's ideas.

## REFERENE LIST

Atkins, A. 2002. *Critical Discourse Analysis: A letter to expatriates from Rt Hon Norman Fowler*. Oxford: Oxford Press.

Bruce, C. S., 1994. "Research Student's experiences of the dissertation literature review". *Students in Higher Education* , Volume 19.2, pp. 217-229.

Bryman, A., 2012. *Social Research Methods*. Fourth ed. New York: Oxford University Press.

Chakaodza, B., 2003. *The state of media in Zimbabwe: Paper presentation at the Media Institute of Southern Africa Annual general meeting*, s.l.: Maseru.

Cooper, H., 1998. *Synthesising Research: A Guide for Literature Review*. London : Sage.

Dant, T., 2003. *Critical Social Theory: Society and Critique*. London: Sage Publications.

Deetz, S. A., 1992. Critical Theory In: D. D. Cahn. Jr, ed. *Democracy in an Age of Corporate Colonisation: Developments in Communication and the Politics of Everyday Life*. Albany NY: State University of New York Press.

Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S., 2000. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. London: Sage.

Fairclough, N., 1995. *Critical Discourse Analysis*. London : Longman.

Fairclough, N., 1995. *Media Discourse*. London : Arnold.

Fairclough, N., 2003. *Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research*. London: Longman Group Limited.

- Fairclough, N. and Wodak, R., 1997. Critical Discourse Analysis. In: T. A. Van Dijk, ed. *Discourse as a Social Interaction*. London: Sage Publications, p. 257-284.
- Foucault, M., 1976/1994. TL. In: *Critique and Power: Recasting the Foucault/Harabamas Debate*. Cambridge: The MIT Press, pp. 17-46.
- Fowler, R., 1991. *Language in the News: Discourse and Ideology in the Press*. London: Routledge.
- Gramsci, A., 1971. The Intellectuals. In: Q. H. a. G. N. Smith, ed. *Selections from the Prison Notebooks*. London: Lawrence and Wishart, pp. 5-23.
- Hall, S., 1982. The Redicover of Ideology: Return of the Repressed in Media Studies . In: J. C. a. J. W. T Bennet, ed. *Culture, Society and the Media*. London: Methuen.
- Hall, S., 1997. *Representation: Cultural Representation and Signifying*. London : Sage Publications.
- Hall, S., 2008. *Representation and the Media*. s.l., <http://www.youtube.com>.
- Holub, R., 1992. *Antonio Gramsci :Beyond Marxism and Postmodernism*. London: Routledge.
- Huckett, R. A., 1984. Decline of a Paradigm? Bias and Objectivity in News Media Studies. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, Volume 1.3, pp. 229-259.
- Kumar, R., 2005. *Research Methodology*. second ed. London: SAGE Publications Inc.
- Lindlof, R. T., 1995. *Qualitative Communication Research Methods*. London: Sage.
- MacDonald, M., 2003. *Exploring Media Discourse*. London: Arnold.

- Machinya, J., 2014. *The role:A*, Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.
- Masimbiti, T., 2013. *An assessment of the socio-economic benefits* , Gweru: Midlands State University.
- Mawowa, S., 2013. *Community Share Ownership Trusts in Zimbabwe's Mining Sector: The Case of Mhondoro-Ngezi*, Harare: Zimbabwe Environmental Law Association.
- McCullagh, C., 2002. *Media Power:A sociological Introduction*. New York: Palgrave.
- McNair, B., 2001. *The Sociology of News*. London: Arnold.
- Meyers, M. D., 1997. Qualitative Research in Information Systems. *MIS Quarterly*, Volume 21.1, pp. 241-242.
- Negi, R., 2000. The Mining Boom, Capital and Chiefs in the New Copper-belt. In: A. F. a. M. Larner, ed. *Zambia Mining and Neoliberalism: Boom and Bust onthe Globalised Copper-belt*. New York : Palgrave , p. 200.
- Neumann, E. N., 1972. The Spiral of Silence: A Theory of Public Opinion. *Journal of Communication*, Volume 24, p. 2.
- NIIEB, 2011. *Uderstanding Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment*. Harare: s.n.
- Price, M. E. and Krug, P.,2000. *The enabling environment for free and independent media. Paper by the programme in comparative Media Law and Policy Centre for Soscio Legal Studies*, Oxford: Wolfson College.
- Talbot, M., 2007. *Media Discourse: Representation and Interaction*. Edinburgh : Edinburgh University Press.

Tuchman, G., 1976. Telling Stories. *Journal of Communication*, Volume 26, pp. 93-97.

Van Dijk, T. A., 1993. Discourse Analysis: Its development and application. *Journal of Communication*, Volume 33(2) , pp. 20-43.

Wodak, N. F. R., 1997. Critical Discourse Analysis. In: T. A. V. Dijk, ed. *Discourse as a Social Interaction*. London: Sage Publications, p. 257 284.

Wodak, R., 1997. *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. London: Sage

Wodak, R. and Meyer, M., 2009. *Methods for Critical Discourse Analysis*. London: Sage.



